

## MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

OF

# The Honourable the House of Assembly

At a meeting of the House of Assembly at the Parliament Buildings on Tuesday, the 15th day of December, 2015, pursuant to the adjournment.

#### PRESENT

His Honour M. A. Carrington, Q.C., B.A., LL.B. (Speaker) Her Honour Mrs. M-J. M. Thompson, B.A., M.Sc. (Ph. Ed.) (Deputy Speaker) Rt. Hon. O. S. Arthur, M.Sc. (Econ.) Mr. G. A. Clarke, J.P., B.Sc., Dip. Ed. Mr. R. St. C. Toppin, LL.B. (Hons.) Community Development) Hon. D. St. E. Kellman (Minister of Housing, Lands and Rural Development) Hon. Miss M. A. Mottley, Q.C., LL.B. (Leader of the Opposition) and Drainage) Miss C. Y. Forde, J.P., L.C.P. Hon. R. D. Jones, J.P., B.A. (Hons.), M.A. Ed. (Minister of Education, Affairs) Science, Technology and Innovation) Dr. the Hon. D. C. Estwick, B.Sc., M.B., B.S. (Minister of Agriculture, Food, Fisheries and Water Resource *Management*) Mr. D. D. Marshall, Q.C., LL.B. (Hons.), L.E.C. Hon. M. A. Lashley, LL.B. (Hons.) (Minister of Transport and Works) Rt. Hon. F. J. Stuart, Q.C., B.A., LL.M. Mr. T. A. Prescod, B.A. (Prime Minister, Minister of National Security, The Public Service and *Urban Development*) Hon. J. D. E. Boyce, M.Sc., C. Eng. and (Minister of Health) (Leader of the House)

Hon. S. D. Blackett (Minister of Social Care, Constituency Empowerment and

Mr. J. D. Paul, B.Sc. (Chairman of Committees)

Dr. the Hon. D. S. Lowe, Dip. Theology, B.A., M.Ed., Ed.D. (Minister of Environment

Hon. A. D. Brathwaite, Q.C., LL.B. (Hons.) (Attorney General and Minister of Home

Hon. S. A. Lashley, B.Sc., LL.B. (Hons.), L.E.C. (Minister of Culture, Sports and Youth)

Hon. D. O'N. Inniss, B.Sc., M.B.A. (Minister of Industry, International Business, Commerce and Small Business Development)

- Hon. C. P. Sinckler, B.A., M.Sc. (Minister of Finance and Economic Affairs)
- Lt. Col. J. D. Bostic, MVO, B.A. (Hons.)
- Mr. E. G. Hinkson, LL.B. (Hons.), L.E.C., LL.M.
- Mr. D. G. Sutherland, B.Sc., M.Sc., M.B.A. (Dist.)
- Miss S. J. O. Bradshaw, LL.B. (Hons.)

#### ABSENT

Mr. G. W. Payne, Q.C., Hon. R. L. Sealy, B.Sc., M.B.A. (*Minister of Tourism and International Transport*), Mr. K. D. Symmonds, B.A., LL.B., and Dr. M. M. Agard, J.P., B.Sc., M.Sc., D.D.S.

Mr. Speaker took the Chair at 10.15 a.m.

Prayers were taken by Rev. Mark Harewood.

#### MINUTES

The Minutes of the meetings of Tuesday, 17th November, 2015 and Tuesday 24th November, 2015 were taken as read and were confirmed on the motion of Hon. J. D. E. Boyce seconded by Hon. A. D. Brathwaite.

#### PAPERS

By command Hon. C. P. Sinckler laid the following:

1. Duties, Taxes and Other Payments (Exemption) (Barbados Port Inc.) (No. ) Order, 2015.

2. Duties, Taxes and Other Payments (Exemption) (Republic Finance & Trust (Barbados) Corporation) Order, 2015.

By command Dr. the Hon. D. C. Estwick laid the following:

Barbados Agricultural Management Co. Ltd.:

- Nineteenth Annual Report and Accounts for the year ended June 30, 2012;
- Twentieth Annual Report and Accounts for the year ended June 30, 2013; and
- Twenty-first Annual Report and Accounts for the year ended June 30, 2014.

By command Hon. J. D. E. Boyce laid the following:

Report on the Unemployment Fund for the years 2010 and 2011.

### FIRST READINGS OF BILLS

On the separate motion of Hon. J. D. E. Boyce seconded by Hon. A. D. Brathwaite the following Bills were read a first time:

1. Holidays with Pay Bill, 2015.

2. Labour Department (Amendment) Bill, 2015.

#### ORDERS OF THE DAY

#### SUSPENSION OF STANDING ORDERS

On the motion of Hon. J. D. E. Boyce seconded by Hon. A. D. Brathwaite Standing Orders 6, 16, 18, 20, 42(5), 43 and 44 were suspended for the remainder of the day's Sitting.

#### **GOVERNMENT BUSINESS**

On the motion of Hon. J. D. E. Boyce seconded by Hon. A. D. Brathwaite the House resolved itself into Committee of Supply, Mr. J. D. Paul in the Chair.

#### **ORDER NO. 16**

#### SUPPLEMENTARY RESOLUTION NO. 4 – 2015/2016

HEAD 15: CABINET OFFICE – \$2,040,000

Rt. Hon. F. J. Stuart spoke on the following Resolution:

#### RESOLVED that the sum of TWO MILLION AND FORTY THOUSAND

DOLLARS be granted from the Consolidated Fund and be placed at the disposal of the Government to supplement the Estimates 2015-2016 as shown in the Supplementary Estimates No. 4, 2015-2016 which form the Schedule to this Resolution.

#### **SCHEDULE**

#### Supplementary Estimates 2015–2016 No. 4

HEAD	Code Number	Provision in Approved Estimates 2015 – 2016	Provision in Supplementary Esti- mates Nos. 1 – 3	Supplementary Provision Required
		Other Expenditure	Other Expenditure	Other Expenditure
HEAD 15 – CABINET OFFICE <b>Program 070: Cabinet</b> <b>Secretariat</b> Subprogram 7020: General Management and Coordination Services <i>Account Code: 230 – Contin- gencies</i>	150707020	\$ 250,000	\$	\$ 2,040,000

and moved seconded by Hon. A. D. Brathwaite that Head 15 stand part.

Hon. Miss M. A. Mottley spoke.

Hon. D. St. E. Kellman spoke.

Miss S. J. O. Bradshaw spoke.

Hon. C. P. Sinckler spoke.

Mr. D. G. Sutherland began to speak.

Hon. D. St. E. Kellman spoke on a point of order.

Mr. D. G. Sutherland concluded his speech.

On the motion of Hon. J. D. E. Boyce seconded by Hon. A. D. Brathwaite the Chairman reported progress and asked for leave to sit again. The Speaker resumed the Chair and reported accordingly.

**SUSPENSION** 

On the motion of Hon. J. D. E. Boyce seconded by Hon. A. D. Brathwaite the Sitting was suspended to 2.00 p.m.

At 12.28 p.m. the Speaker suspended the Sitting.

#### RESUMPTION

On resumption, Mr. Speaker in the Chair. The House reverted to Committee of Supply.

#### HEAD 15 (resumed)

Hon. J. D. E. Boyce spoke.
Miss C. Y. Forde spoke.
Mr. G. A. Clarke began to speak.
Rt. Hon. F. J. Stuart spoke on a point of order.
Mr. G. A. Clarke concluded.
Hon. R. D. Jones spoke.
Lt. Col. J. D. Bostic spoke in reply.
Hon. D. St. E. Kellman spoke.

Rt. Hon. F. J. Stuart spoke in reply.

Head 15 was passed.

#### ORDER NO. 18 – SUPPLEMENTARY RESOLUTION NO. 5 – 2015/2016 HEAD 13 – PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE – \$1,316,658

Rt. Hon. F. J. Stuart spoke on the following Resolution:

RESOLVED that the sum of ONE MILLION THREE HUNDRED AND SIXTEEN THOUSAND SIX HUNDRED AND FIFTY-EIGHT DOLLARS be granted from the Consolidated Fund and be placed at the disposal of the Government to supplement the Estimates 2015-2016 as shown in the Supplementary Estimates No. 5, 2015-2016 which form the Schedule to this Resolution.

#### **SCHEDULE**

HEAD	Code Number	Provision in Approved Estimates 2015 – 2016	Provision in Supplementary Esti- mates Nos. 1 – 4	Supplementary Provision Required
		Other Expenditure	Other Expenditure	Other Expenditure
HEAD 13 – PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE <b>Program 495: 50th Anniversary</b> <b>of Independence Celebrations</b> Subprogram 8500: Secretariat for the 50th Anniversary of Independence Celebrations	134958500	\$	\$	\$
Account Code: 102 – Other Personal Emoluments Account Code: 103 – Employers		0		17,348
Contributions		0		1,778
Account Code: 206 – Travel		0		8,000
Account Code: 207 – Utilities Account Code: 208 – Rental of		0		54,150
Property Account Code: 209 – Library		0		109,280
Books and Publications Account Code: 210 – Supplies		0		3,000
and Materials Account Code: 211 – Maintenance		0		47,397
of Property		0		6,000
Account Code: 212 – Operating Expenses		0		1,029,805
Account Code: 752 – Machinery and Equipment		0		25,000
Account Code: 753 – Furniture and Fixtures		0		14,900

#### Supplementary Estimates 2015–2016 No. 5

and moved seconded by Hon. J. D. E. Boyce that Head 13 stand part.

Mr. G. A. Clarke spoke.

Hon. J. D. E. Boyce spoke. Head 13 was passed. 4

### ORDER NO. 23 – SUPPLEMENTARY ESTIMATES NO. 6 – 2015/2016 – \$10,431,030

Hon. C. P. Sinckler spoke on the following Resolution:

RESOLVED that the sum of TEN MILLION FOUR HUNDRED AND THIRTY-ONE THOUSAND AND THIRTY DOLLARS be granted from the Consolidated Fund and be placed at the disposal of the Government to supplement the Estimates 2015-2016 as shown in the Supplementary Estimates No. 6, 2015-2016 which form the Schedule to this Resolution.

#### SCHEDULE

#### Provision in Provision in Supplementary Approved Estimates Provision Supplementary Estimates Nos. 1 - 5 Required HEAD Code 2015 - 2016 Number Other Other Other Expenditure Expenditure Expenditure \$ \$ \$ HEAD 16 - MINISTRY OF CIVIL SERVICE **Program 484: Human Resource** Strategy Subprogram 0335: Government Wide Area Network Project 164840335 Account Code: 226 - Professional Services 595,997 776,800 HEAD 21 - MINISTRY OF FINANCE AND ECONOMIC AFFAIRS **Program 112: Financial Control and Treasury** Management Subprogram 0131: Treasury 211120131 Account Code: 212 – Operating Expenses 2,131,597 1,800,000 **Program 113: Revenue** Collection 211130133 Subprogram 0133: Customs Account Code: 102 – Other Personal Emoluments 680,456 5,175,809 Account Code: 103 – Employers *Contributions* 390,499 2,457,676 HEAD 79 - MINISTRY OF INDUSTRY, INTERNA-TIONAL BUSINESS. COMMERCE AND SMALL **BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT Program 040: Direction and Policy Formulation Services** Subprogram 0490: International Business and Financial Services 790400490 Account Code: 212 - Operating Expenses 189,116 220,745

#### Supplementary Estimates 2015–2016 No. 6

and moved seconded by Hon. J. D. E. Boyce that Head 21 stand part.

The motion was passed.

#### HEAD 79 – MINISTRY OF INDUSTRY, INTERNATIONAL BUSINESS, COMMERCE AND SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT – \$220,745.00

Hon. D. O'N. Inniss spoke and moved seconded by Rt. Hon. F. J. Stuart that Head 79 stand part. The motion was carried.

#### HEAD 16 - MINISTRY OF CIVIL SERVICE - \$776,800

Rt. Hon. F. J. Stuart spoke and moved seconded by Hon. M. A. Lashley that Head 16 stand part. The motion was carried.

Hon. J. D. E. Boyce moved seconded by Rt. Hon. F. J. Stuart the passing of three Money Resolutions in Committee of Supply.

The motion was carried.

The Speaker resumed the Chair and reported accordingly.

On the separate motion of Hon. J. D. E. Boyce seconded by Rt. Hon. F. J. Stuart the Resolutions were read a first and second time and agreed to.

#### **SUSPENSION**

On the motion of Hon. J. D. E. Boyce seconded by Rt. Hon. F. J. Stuart the Sitting was suspended to 5.00 p.m.

At 4.44 p.m. the Speaker suspended the Sitting.

#### RESUMPTION

On resumption, Mr. Speaker in the Chair.

#### **ORDER NO. 17**

On the Order being called for Hon. C. P. Sinckler to move the second reading of the Bill entitled the Value Added Tax (Amendment) (No. 2) Bill, 2015,

the Hon. Member spoke and moved seconded by Hon. J. D. E. Boyce that the Bill be read a second time.

#### SUSPENSION

On the motion of Hon. J. D. E. Boyce seconded by Rt. Hon. F. J. Stuart the Sitting was suspended to 6.25 p.m.

At 6.17 p.m. the Sitting was suspended.

#### RESUMPTION

On resumption, Mr. Speaker in the Chair.

#### **SUSPENSION**

On the motion of Hon. J. D. E. Boyce seconded by Hon. C. P. Sinckler the Sitting was suspended to 6.50 p.m.

At 6.40 p.m. the Speaker suspended the Sitting.

#### RESUMPTION

On resumption, Mr. Speaker in the Chair.

#### **ORDER NO. 17 (resumed)**

Hon. Miss M. A. Mottley began to speak.

Hon. C. P. Sinckler spoke on a point of elucidation.

Hon. Miss M. A. Mottley resumed her speech.

Hon. C. P. Sinckler spoke on a point of order.

Hon. Miss M. A. Mottley resumed her speech.

Hon. C. P. Sinckler spoke on a point of order.

Hon. Miss M. A. Mottley concluded her speech.

#### **SUSPENSION**

On the motion of Hon. J. D. E. Boyce seconded by Rt. Hon. F. J. Stuart the Sitting was suspended to 8.45 p.m.

At 8.04 p.m. the Speaker suspended the Sitting.

#### RESUMPTION

On resumption, Mr. Speaker in the Chair.

#### **ORDER NO. 17 (resumed)**

Hon. C. P. Sinckler spoke in reply.

The Bill was read a second time.

On the motion of Hon. C. P. Sinckler seconded by Hon. J. D. E. Boyce the House resolved itself into Committee, Mr. J. D. Paul in the Chair.

Clauses 1 (as amended), 2 and 3 (as amended) were called and passed on the separate motion of Hon. C. P. Sinckler seconded by Rt. Hon. F. J. Stuart.

Clauses 4 to 7, 9, 10, 11, 13 to 19 (as amended), 20 and 21 were called and passed on the separate motion of Hon. C. P. Sinckler seconded by Hon. J. D. E. Boyce.

Clause 8 (as amended) was called and passed on the motion of Hon. C. P. Sinckler seconded by Hon. R. D. Jones.

Clause 12, Hon. C. P. Sinckler spoke and proposed an amendment inserting words. The motion was seconded by Hon. J. D. E. Boyce.

Hon. Miss M. A. Mottley spoke and moved seconded by Miss S. J. O. Bradshaw that the words sought to be inserted be left out and other words be inserted. The motion was negatived.

The question that the words proposed to be inserted by the first motion was affirmed.

On the motion of Hon. C. P. Sinckler seconded by Hon. J. D. E. Boyce the Chairman reported the passing of the Bill in Committee and Mr. Speaker resumed the Chair and reported accordingly.

On the separate motion of Hon. C. P. Sinckler seconded by Rt. Hon. F. J. Stuart the Bill was read a third time and passed and the title read and agreed to.

#### **NOTICE OF QUESTIONS (recommitted)**

Miss C. Y. Forde gave notice of the following:

#### To ask the Minister of Youth, Sports and Culture:

- 1. Is the Minister aware:
  - (a) Rock Hall, St. Thomas has been declared the first Freedom Village in Barbados?
  - (b) that six (6) shops were erected in 2009 at the Freedom Village site to afford residents opportunities to engage their entrepreneurial skills, providing services to locals and visitors through the plying of their trade and to gain income?
  - (c) that the six (6) shops were critical to providing opportunities and hope to the residents who were integral in the vision and conceptual development of the Freedom Village Project?
  - (d) that the six (6) shops were to be officially handed over to the concessionaires over four
     (4) years ago? (September 2011).
  - (e) that the entire environs at the Freedom Village are dangerous and unkempt with deep ravines and overgrown bush, which would attract vermin and vandals that would in turn harm locals and visitors who visit that location daily?
  - (f) that the Freedom Village Project merits completion so as to provide another attraction for visitors to the island.
- 2. If the Minister is aware, will the Minister state:-
  - (a) the status of the small shops and their completion date?
  - (b) What plans there are, if any, to hand over the shops to residents so that they can proceed to ply their trade and earn an honest living?
  - (c) What plans there are, if any, to debush and beautify the Freedom Village site so as to provide another viable option for the promotion of the heritage and tourism product?

(d) Whether the Government intends to bring the Freedom Village Project to completion by the installation of the **link bridge**, the construction of the **car park** and the **interpretation centre** and other remedial works so that the project may become a viable entity that would earn revenue for this country?

Notice of this question was given on 15th December 2015.

#### To ask the Minister of Tourism:

- 1. Is the Minister aware:
  - (a) that the government of Barbados has invested hundreds of millions of taxpayers' dollars in the redevelopment of Harrison's Cave over the past thirty-five (35) years?
  - (b) that (Caves of Barbados) Harrison's Cave is one of the most beautiful attractions in Barbados for locals and visitors that has the capacity to earn large amounts of foreign exchange?
  - (c) that the Redevelopment Project of 2006/2010 through the World Bank loan, totaled US \$35m?
  - (d) that there have been heavy financial losses in Caves of Barbados' revenue over the past seven (7) years?
- 2. If the Minister is aware, will the Minister state:-
  - (a) what immediate plans there are, if any, to strengthen the management structure and to institute stronger accounting measures to ensure efficiency and profitability of Harrison's Cave?
  - (b) what plans the Ministry of Tourism has, if any, to lease the Harrison's Cave to a private entity/entities to oversee its management?
  - (c) what are the immediate plans, if any, of the Ministry of Tourism and Caves of Barbados regarding:
    - i. the future of the existing staff, concessionaires and service providers,
    - ii. property owners, residents and those who qualify for royalties and compensation for land acquired to facilitate the expansion of Harrison's Cave over the years?

Notice of this question was given on 15th December 2015.

#### To ask the Minister of Social Care, Constituency Empowerment:

- 1. Is the Minister aware:
  - (a) that the Child Care Board is mandated by law to lay its Annual Reports and Financial Statements in this august Chamber?
  - (b) that there have been no Audited Accounts or Reports laid since 2009 as required?
  - (c) that a large percentage of reports from the public on matters pertaining to concerns about minors have not been formally handled or explored.
  - (d) that some parents, guardians and relevant agencies are delinquent in providing the requisite information associated with all forms of abuse which are perpetrated on minors.
  - (e) that a large percentage of under-aged female and males are abused by adults, particularly males, who are engaged in carnal knowledge with young girls, thus leading to teen-aged pregnancies, long term trauma and hardship.

- (f) that the ratio of staff to wards is too large for effective and efficient management in the care and supervision of those in the various Child Care institutions.
- (g) that there are dozens of private businesses which offer Day Care services that are illegally operating.
- (h) that many of these facilities do not meet the required standard to operate or provide services nor do the staff members possess the requisite training or skill to provide quality care and supervision.
- 2. If the Minister is aware, will the Minister outline:-
  - (a) what plans there are, if any, to have these outstanding Annual Reports and Financial Statements laid as a matter of urgency?
  - (b) what resources would be required to adequately provide the appropriate staffing complement and housing accommodation for wards in the Children's Homes?
  - (c) what measures there are, if any, planned for the upgrading or amending of legislation to enforce the laws which would prosecute such paedophiles and child molesters in our society who abuse our children.
  - (d) what immediate plans there are, if any, to halt the blatant breach of standards set by the Child Care Board for the functioning of Day Care Centres and to enforce compliance by those illegally operated Day Care facilities?
  - (e) what systems, if any, have been contemplated to increase the staff complement and upgrade facilities to provide the best quality care for wards.

Notice of this question was given on 15th December 2015.

#### ADJOURNMENT

Hon. J. D. E. Boyce spoke and moved seconded by Miss S. J. O. Bradshaw, who spoke, that the House be adjourned to the 26th January, 2016.

Mr. Speaker spoke and at 10.20 p.m. adjourned the House.

#### RICHARD P. BYER Deputy Clerk of Parliament.

The Minutes were certified correct and confirmed the , 2016.

day of

Speaker.

HOUSE OF ASSEMBLY PARLIAMENT BUILDINGS BRIDGETOWN.

## HOUSE OF ASSEMBLY

FIRST SESSION OF 2013 - 2018

### MINUTES

Tuesday, 15th December, 2015.

Government Printing Department.